

NOMINATION COMMITTEE MAY 2025

Proposed Deliverance

The General Assembly:

1. Receive the Report.
2. Thank those who have offered their skills to serve the Standing Committees of the General Assembly through the nomination cycle of 2024/25.
3. Note that a Strategic Review has been undertaken and that a number of action points have been implemented, including the production of a Nominations Handbook, and agree that the review of the nominations process will continue within the Nomination Committee as an integral part of its work (*Section 2*).
4. Note the intention of the Committee to seek a conversation with the Assembly Trustees regarding the processes for making appointments to the Assembly Trustees and its Sub-Committees in relation to the involvement and place of the Nomination Committee (*Section 2.3.4*).
5. Make alterations to the Standing Committees of the General Assembly as set forth in the Report (*Section 5*).
6. Appoint Andrew Tait as Convener of the Chaplains to HM Forces Committee (from September 2024) (*Section 5.1*).
7. Reappoint Shona Haldane as a Convener of the Discipline Tribunal (*Section 5.1*).
8. Reappoint James Drummond Young as Convener of the Judicial Commission (*Section 5.1*).
9. Appoint Sigrid Marten as Convener of the Iona Community Board for two years (*Section 5.1*).
10. Agree to suspend Standing Order 122 and reappoint James Stewart as Convener of the Life and Work Advisory Committee for one year (*Section 5.1*).
11. Appoint Paul Nimmo as Convener of the Theological Forum (*Section 5.1*).
12. Agree to suspend Standing Order 122 and reappoint Hilary McDougall as Vice-Convener of the Registration of Ministries Committee for one year (*Section 5.1*).

Report

1. COMMITTEE REMIT AND PROCESS

1.1 Preamble

1.1.1 The remit of the Nomination Committee is to identify Ministers, Deacons, Elders and Members with relevant skills and experience to serve the Standing Committees of the General Assembly. The Nomination Committee works with Standing Committees to ensure that the appointment of Conveners and Vice-Conveners is done in a fair and transparent manner.

1.1.2 At the time of writing this report, nine vacancies remain unfilled on Standing Committees.

1.1.3 The Communications Department helped raise the profile of the Nomination Committee by distributing two short videos promoting the work of the Nomination Committee.

1.1.4 The Committee continues to support the work of the Assembly Trustees and its Sub-Committees (Seeds for Growth and the Equality Diversity and Inclusion (EDI) Group) in the appointment of Conveners, Vice-Conveners, and members.

1.2 Meetings and Membership

1.2.1 Nomination Committee meetings in 2024/25 took place in a hybrid format in order to reduce costs and contribute to the General Assembly's strategy towards a Net Zero Pathway.

1.2.2 It was with sadness that the Committee learned about the untimely death of one of its members, Rev Linda Pollock. The Committee appreciates the diligence with which Linda undertook her duties and has extended condolences to her family.

1.3 Appointments to Legal Bodies

1.3.1 The Committee received names at its January meeting from the Convener of the Legal Questions Committee, Principal Clerk and Depute Clerk.

1.3.2 The Committee is pleased to report an increase in the number of new members to the Legal Bodies and expresses thanks to all those who provide professional expertise to the Church in this way.

2. STRATEGIC REVIEW OF THE NOMINATIONS PROCESS

2.1 Context

2.1.1 The General Assembly of 2023 agreed the following section of deliverance: "Instruct the Nomination Committee to carry out a strategic review of the General Assembly's nomination process and put forward proposals for reform to the General Assembly of 2024".

2.1.2 At the General Assembly of 2024, it was noted that a Strategic Review Group had been established and the work of review was underway. The Review Group had identified six areas of work as the parameters for review: internal working of the Committee; sources of information; the recruitment process and engagement with the wider church; eligibility for membership of committees and other bodies; working with Conveners of other committees and bodies and working with the new enlarged Presbyteries. The scope of the review was agreed by the General Assembly of 2024 and it was noted that further recommendations would be brought to the General Assembly of 2025.

2.2 Strategic Review

2.2.1 During 2024/25, the Strategic Review Group focussed on one or two topics from each of these areas of work. It also met with representatives of the EDI Group and is grateful for their input into the review.

2.2.2 Some changes have already been implemented to the nominations process, including those described in the following paragraphs.

2.2.3 Nominations Handbook. A Nomination Committee Handbook has been compiled, containing sections on the principles of the work of nominations, the relevant sections from Standing Orders; policies; a timeline of the annual work of the Nomination Committee with application forms and standard forms of communication; and guidance on the process for mid-year appointments. Much of the information already existed, but the Handbook helpfully pulls it together in one place. New resources and Guidance Notes are also being developed and added to the Handbook as they become available. At this stage the Handbook will not be made more widely available as it is felt that it would be better to focus on maintaining the Handbook as a comprehensive and current resource for the Nomination Committee itself. However, information, forms and guidance can be extracted and sent to others in the Church as required.

2.2.4 Application Deadline. In practice, the annual application deadline of 30 November usually had to be extended several times. Now that electronic systems allow application forms to be processed more easily, it was decided that the deadline could be moved to the first week in January to give more time for people to make their applications. This has already been implemented for appointments to be made at the General Assembly of 2025.

2.2.5 Notification of Applicants. The time frame for notifying those who are being nominated for a Standing Committee, and those who have not been nominated at this time, has been brought forward. The aim is for all applicants to receive a response within a month after the January/February meeting of the Nomination Committee.

2.2.6 Standing Orders. The Committee is grateful to have had input into the revision of the Standing Orders as they relate to the Standing Committees and their membership. The Committee expresses thanks to its Secretary for her work on these. It is hoped that the amendments will provide greater clarity and consistency which in turn will help to streamline the work of the Committee.

2.2.7 Candidates, Probationers and New Ministers. In 2021, the General Assembly adopted a policy whereby "Candidates in Training, Probationers and Ministers in their first year after ordination will not normally be appointed to serve on Standing Committees". The Review Group was aware that purpose of the policy was not well understood in the Church and that exceptions had been made for reasons which were not always articulated. Over the past year, the Committee has sought to apply the policy in a more open, transparent and consistent way. The policy is in no way intended as a rejection of the skills and experience possessed by Ministers in training or new Ministers; rather it is a pastoral measure to ensure that those individuals can focus on ministry formation in their local setting and in their own Presbytery. Where the Nomination Committee allows an exception to the policy, it is where the Candidate, Probationer or new Minister has particular qualities, skills or experience which would be of benefit to the Standing Committee in question and where the individual is confident they can take on the workload at this time. Although some applications this year have not been accepted as a result of the policy, the Committee warmly encourages individuals to apply again at a later date.

2.2.8 Presbytery Selections. In 2024/25, the Committee asked those being selected by Presbyteries as possible nominees for the Committee to Nominate the Moderator to complete a short form to provide the Nomination Committee with more information to assist in seeking balance in its nominations. The Committee is grateful to those who completed the form and encourages Presbyteries to request that those selected by them do this again in future years.

2.2.9 Presbytery Appointments. The Committee produced a Guidance Note on the process of direct appointments by Presbyteries to the Faith Action Programme Leadership Team (FAPLT) and feedback from some Presbyteries suggests that this was helpful. It is noted that the process of direct appointments by Presbyteries in 2024/25 has resulted in a decrease in the balance within FAPLT.

2.3 Topics for Review in 2025/26

2.3.1 The Committee has identified some areas on which to focus its review during the coming year, including those identified in the following paragraphs.

2.3.2 Accessibility. Following discussion with the EDI Group, the Committee will consider the introduction of an Equalities Monitoring Form at the end of the application form and/or inviting an EDI representative to be present at Committee meetings.

2.3.3 Application Forms. Following feedback from applicants, other Committees and the EDI Group, the Committee plans to review the application and supporting forms as a whole in terms of their format and content, and to consider a simplified application process for reappointments.

2.3.4 Assembly Trustees and Sub-Committees. The Committee is not directly involved in the recruitment process for the Assembly Trustees but it does have a consultative role. Appointments to the Sub-Committees of the Assembly Trustees are made by the Assembly Trustees, but the Committee has a role in receiving applications and helping to ensure a fair and transparent process. The Committee would welcome a conversation with the Assembly Trustees to explore ways in which the co-ordination between the Committee and the Assembly Trustees can be developed in order to better streamline these processes.

2.4 Looking Ahead

2.4.1 The Committee is grateful to the members of the Strategic Review Group, which comprised the Convener, Vice Convener, Secretary, Administrator and a member of the Nomination Committee, along with (for part of 2024 and

2025 only) the Liaison Trustee from the Assembly Trustees and the Secretary of the Assembly and Presbytery Clerks Forum. With the scope of review of the nominations process having been agreed and the practical work of review well underway, the Nomination Committee proposes that the review is now integrated into the Committee as a whole rather than within the separate Strategic Review Group. The Committee assures the General Assembly that it will continue to consider each area of review to ensure that it fulfils its remit in a way that is efficient, effective, clear and consistent, both internally and in its engagement with other Committees, Presbyteries, applicants and all in the wider Church.

3. APPOINTMENTS TO THE ASSEMBLY TRUSTEES AND SUB-COMMITTEES

3.1 Assembly Trustees

3.1.1 The Nomination Committee was not involved before or during the recruitment process but is satisfied that new appointments being proposed by the Assembly Trustees have been selected in a fair and transparent manner.

3.2 Seeds for Growth Committee

3.2.1 A representative from the Nomination Committee was present when the Seeds for Growth Committee met and selected nominees. The Committee is satisfied that the process for appointments to the Seeds for Growth Committee was fair and transparent.

3.2.2 Furthermore, the Nomination Committee is satisfied that the process for appointment of a new Convener was conducted in a fair and transparent manner with a member of the Nomination Committee being present when interviews for the post were conducted.

3.3 EDI Group

3.3.1 A representative from the Nomination Committee was present when the EDI Group met and selected nominees. The Committee is satisfied that the process for appointments and reappointments to the EDI Group was fair and transparent.

3.3.2 Furthermore, the Nomination Committee is satisfied that the process for appointment of a new Vice-Convener was conducted in a fair and transparent manner.

4. NOMINATION PROCESS FOR 2024/25

4.1 Mid-Year Vacancies

4.1.1 The work of the Nomination Committee continues throughout the year with the need to fill mid-year vacancies caused by members of Standing Committees choosing to resign their appointment. The Convener, Vice-Convener, Secretary and Administrator are continually engaged in supporting Committees and other bodies to ensure their work can continue with the minimum impact following a resignation.

4.1.2 The Committee has been concerned with the number of mid-year vacancies that have required to be filled in the course of the year, with a significant number relating to the work of FAPLT and its Programme Groups. In the period between the General Assembly in 2024 and the date of writing the report, the Committee has worked to fill 26 mid-year vacancies which is a 100% increase from the 13 mid-year vacancies filled in the same period in the previous year.

4.1.3 The Committee is keeping an open mind on the reasons for this increase in the number of resignations and mid-year vacancies and will report to the General Assembly of 2026 should the trend continue.

4.2 Appointment of Conveners and Vice-Conveners

4.2.1 In accordance with the Standing Orders of the General Assembly, the Committee reminds all Committees and bodies of the need to ensure that the nomination of a Convener or Vice-Convener should only be made after an "open and transparent process" involving the Nomination Committee.

4.2.2 The Nomination Committee would encourage that in all such appointments, an application and interview process which is both fair and robust is employed by Standing Committees.

4.2.3 It is important that the General Assembly have confidence in the process employed by Standing Committees of the nomination of individuals for appointment to leadership positions within the Church.

4.2.4 In accordance with this, the Nomination Committee undertook a search process for a Vice-Convener this year which included the intimation of the vacancy and opportunity for an expression of interest to all members, and a robust interview conducted by the Convener and two members of the Committee. The Committee then discussed fully the vacancy and the recommendation of the interview panel at a regular meeting.

4.3 Facts and Figures

4.3.1 A total of 54 proposed nominees were considered with several individuals proposed for more than one Standing Committee, and a further 17 individuals agreeing to serve on various Legal Bodies.

4.3.2 From the online forms submitted, 44% heard about the nomination process through e-mail directly from the Nomination Committee, and 20% heard of the process through a member of the Nomination Committee or another Standing Committee. Others heard through their Minister, the Session Clerk, the Presbytery Clerk or Facebook.

4.3.3 Of the 54 people who applied to serve on Standing Committees, almost 42% had not served on a General Assembly Committee in the past 10 years.

4.3.4 Of the nominees considered, 40% indicated that they would be willing to be considered for serving on any Standing Committee.

4.3.5 Of the application forms received for the 54 nominees considered, 41% came from Ministers, 9% came from Presbyteries, 39% came from the Standing Committee and 11% came from Kirk Sessions.

4.3.6 Of the forms received, 14% were from applicants under the age of 45, 58% were in the age bracket 45-64, and 28% were 65 and over.

5. NOMINATIONS FOR APPOINTMENT TO STANDING COMMITTEES

5.1 The Nomination Committee recommends the following appointments:

** denotes a reappointment*

Assembly Business Committee

Vice-Convener Retiring Sheila Kirk

Vice-Convener Appointed Sheila Kirk* (Deer Parish Church) (1yr)

Minister Resigned John Ferguson May 2024

Minister Appointed James Teasdale (Glasgow: Eastwood) (1yr)

Elder Resigning Graeme Roberts

Elder Appointed Iain Cormack (Comrie and Dundurn)

Audit Committee

Minister Resigned Fiona Anderson Aug 2024

Member Appointed Barbara Finlayson May 2024 (Edinburgh: The New Town) (1yr)

Member Retiring Barbara Finlayson

Members Appointed Elaine Barrowman (East Kilbride: Moncreiff) (2yrs), Barbara Finlayson* (Edinburgh: The New Town)

Chaplains to HM Forces Committee

Convener Resigned Scott Brown Sep 2024

Convener Appointed Andrew Tait Sep 2024 (Tullibody: St Serf's)

Vice-Convener Resigned Andrew Tait Sep 2024

Vice-Convener Appointed Amy Bender Oct 2024 (Keith: North, Newmill, Boharm and Rothiemay)

Vice-Convener Retiring Amy Bender

Vice-Convener Appointed Amy Bender* (Keith: North, Newmill, Boharm and Rothiemay)

Ministers Resigned Neil Galbraith Feb 2025, Peter Sutton Jan 2025

Member Resigned Amy Bender Oct 2024

Member Appointed Robert Wright Feb 2025 (Colvend, Southwick and Kirkbean)

Committee to Nominate the Moderator

Ministers and Deacons Appointed Lynsey Brennan (Baldernock linked with Milngavie: St Paul's), Jonny Clipston (Brimmond), Derek Hughes (Glasgow: Easterhouse), Nikki Macdonald (Upper Clyde), Grant MacLaughlan (Dundee: Westgait), Sheila Wallace DCS

Elders Appointed Robert Kenneth (Lausanne: The Scots Kirk), Gordon Macdonald (Prestwick: Kingcase), Connor MacFadyen (Tranent), Frances McCafferty (Dunfermline: Abbey), Elizabeth McClelland (Edinburgh: High (St Giles')), Mabel Wallace (Fort William Kilmallie linked with Kilmonivaig)

Ecumenical Relations Committee

Ministers Resigned Pauline Steenburgen Jan 2025, Peter Sutton Dec 2024

Ministers Appointed Ian Scott McCarthy (Corby), Margaret Fiona Ogg (Presbytery of England and the Channel Islands) (3yrs)

Member Retiring Gemma King

Faith Action Programme

-Leadership Team

Vice-Convener Resigned William Wishart Jul 2024

Vice-Convener Appointed David Clarkson Aug 2024 (Edinburgh: Barclay Viewforth)

Vice-Conveners Retiring David Clarkson, Jonathan Fleming

Vice-Conveners Appointed David Clarkson* (Edinburgh: Barclay Viewforth), Jonathan Fleming* (Greenock: Lyle Kirk), Scott McRoberts (Inverness: St Columba)

Ministers and Deacons Resigned Morag Crawford DCS Nov 2024, Doug Gay Aug 2024

Minister Resigning Scott McRoberts

Ministers Appointed Ibidun Daramola (Foveran) (1yr), Nathan McConnell (Dundee: Downfield Mains) (1yr), Scott McInnes Dec 2024 (Stirling: North), Julia Pizzuto-Pomaco (Peterhead: New)

Ministers from Presbytery Resigned Graham Duffin Jul 2024, Rory MacLeod Oct 2024, Amanda MacQuarrie Sep 2024

Ministers from Presbytery Appointed Everisto Musedza Dec 2024 (Cowal Kirk, Presbytery of the Highlands and Hebrides), David Rankin Nov 2024 (Perth: Riverside, Presbytery of Perth)

Members from Presbytery Resigned Amy-Louise Scott Jul 2024, Linda Watt Sep 2024

Members from Presbytery Appointed Frances Heafield Sep 2024 (Ettrick and Yarrow linked with Selkirk and Ashkirk, Presbytery of Lothian and Borders), Chris Mackintosh Sep 2024 (Burnside Blairbeth, Presbytery of Glasgow)

-Mission Support Programme Group

Minister Resigned Emma McDonald Jan 2025

-People and Training Programme Group

Ministers Resigned Scott Blythe Jul 2024, David Clarkson Aug 2024

Ministers Appointed Timothy Linford (Gorebridge) (2yrs), Hanneke Marshall Aug 2024 (St Machar's Ranfurly Church)

-Presbytery Mission Plan Implementation Group

Minister Resigned Lorna Tunstall Feb 2025

Minister Appointed James Reid Jul 2024 (Burntisland and Kinghorn)

Member Retiring Barbara Finlayson

Members Appointed Barbara Finlayson* (Edinburgh: The New Town), Ruth Mackenzie Aug 2024 (Peterhead: New)

-Public Life and Social Justice

Member Resigned Frances Heafield Sep 2024

Member Appointed Aaran McDonald Oct 2024 (Kilwinning: Abbey)

-Resource and Presence Programme Group

Member Resigned Tom Burnham Aug 2024

Minister Appointed Cindy Campbell (Bermuda: Christ Church, Warwick, and London: St Columba's linked with Newcastle: St Andrew's) (2yrs)

Iona Community Board

Convener Resigning Anikó Schütz Bradwell

Convener Appointed Sigrid Marten (Edinburgh: High (St Giles')) (2yrs)

Legal Questions Committee

Vice-Convener Retiring Katherine Taylor

Vice-Convener Appointed Katherine Taylor* (Tranent) (2yrs)

Minister Retiring Douglas Reid

Minister Appointed Douglas Reid* (Edinburgh: Gorgie and Palmerston Place)

Members Retiring Shona Cook, James McLean, John Ritchie

Members Appointed Douglas Monaghan (Monifieth South Angus), John Ritchie* (Edinburgh: Barclay Viewforth)

Appointment to Legal Bodies

-Discipline Tribunal

Convener Resigned David Burns Jun 2024

Convener Retiring Shona Haldane

Convener Appointed Shona Haldane* (Edinburgh: Wardie)

-Judicial Commission

Convener Retiring James Drummond Young

Convener Appointed James Drummond Young*

Vice-Convener Retiring Colin Renwick

Vice-Convener Appointed Colin Renwick* (Dunblane Cathedral, Kilmadock and Blair Drummond)

-Judicial Panel

Ministers Retiring Jan Mathieson, Gordon McCracken, Ian McLean, MaryAnn Rennie

Ministers Appointed Susan Brown (Coldstream and District Parishes linked Eccles and Leitholm), Brenda Elwell-Sutton (Dundee: Northeast), Christine Goldie (Dumbarton), Gordon Kennedy (Edinburgh: Craiglockhart), Donald MacEwan (Chaplain: University of St Andrews), Jan Mathieson* (Williamwood), Ian McLean* (Montrose: Trinity), Andrea Price (Edinburgh: St Michael's) MaryAnn Rennie* (Dunfermline: Abbey), Matthew Ross (Edinburgh: Canongate)

Elders Retiring Fiona Drysdale, Chris Dunn, Douglas Hamill, Pauline Weibye

Elders Appointed Chris Dunn* (Cumbernauld: Trinity), Pauline Weibye* (Edinburgh: Newington Trinity), William Windram (Bowden and Melrose)

-Ministries Appeal Panel

Member Retiring Isabell Montgomerie

Member Appointed Isabell Montgomerie* (Ochiltree linked with Stair)

-Mission Plan Review Group

Member Appointed Roger Dodd (Coldstream and District Parishes linked Eccles and Leitholm) (2yrs)

Member Resigned Grant Gordon Mar 2024

Life & Work Advisory Committee

Convener Retiring James Stewart

Convener Appointed James Stewart* (Perth: Letham St Mark's) (1yr)

Minister Resigning Rosemary Frew

Minister Retiring Jane Barron

Member Retiring Jane Robson

Members Appointed Jane Robson* (Edinburgh: Northwest Kirk: Cramond and Pennywell), Ruud Witte (Rotterdam: Scots International Church)

Nomination Committee

Vice-Convener Retiring Bryan Kerr

Vice-Convener Appointed Bryan Kerr* (Lanark: Greyfriars)

Minister Retiring Donald Campbell

Minister Passed Away Linda Pollock Nov 2024

Ministers Appointed Matthew Ross (Edinburgh: Canongate), Christopher Wallace (East Mainland)

Members Resigned Jonathan Buchan Feb 2025, John Dent Jul 2024, Robert McQuistan Oct 2024

Member Retiring Connor MacFadyen

Members Appointed Ann Gammack (Ellon), Mhorag Murphy Aug 2024 (Torrance)

Registration of Ministries Committee

Convener Retiring Robert Hamilton

Vice-Convener Retiring Hilary McDougall

Vice-Convener Appointed Hilary McDougall* (Cambuslang) (1yr)

Ministers Appointed Lynn Brady Jul 2024 (Gretna: Old, Gretna: St Andrew's, Half Morton and Kirkpatrick Fleming linked with Hoddum, Kirtle-Eaglesfield and Middlebie), Gary Peacock Jul 2024 (Dumfries: St Michael's and South linked with Irongray, Lochrutton and Terregles)

Safeguarding Committee

Minister Retiring Julia Wiley

Minister Appointed Aaron Stevens (Budapest: St Columba's)

Member Retiring Doreen Henderson

Members Appointed Doreen Henderson* (Kilmore and Oban linked with Tiree), Jane Nicol (Paisley: St Mark's Oldhall)

Social Care Council - CrossReach Board

Minister Resigning Keith Blackwood

Minister Appointed Dawn Westwood (Bathgate: Boghall)

Member Retiring Amy Reid

Member Appointed Amy Reid* (Cumbernauld: Trinity) (3yrs)

Theological Forum

Convener Retiring Liam Fraser

Convener Appointed Paul Nimmo (Aberdeen: St Machar's Cathedral)

Vice-Convener Retiring Paul Nimmo

Vice-Convener Appointed Lynn McChlery (Auchterarder)

Minister Resigning Lynn McChlery

Ministers Retiring John Carswell, Paul Middleton

Minister Appointed Daniel Spencer (Dundee: Northeast, and Dundee: Law)

Member Retiring Joshua Ralston

Members Appointed Helen Bond (Falkirk: Trinity), Sara Mannen (Ellon), Scott Paget (Lanark: Greyfriars) (2yrs)

In the name of the Committee

ANDREW GARDNER, Convener

BRYAN KERR, Vice-Convener

VICTORIA LINFORD, Secretary