

## NOMINATION COMMITTEE MAY 2024

### Proposed Deliverance

#### The General Assembly:

1. Receive the Report.
2. Note the six areas of work of the Strategic Review Group (*Section 3.2.2*).
3. Note the compilation by the Nomination Committee of a handbook to simplify its work, as part of the ongoing Strategic Review (*Section 3.2.5*).
4. Make appointments to the Standing Committees of the General Assembly as set out in the Report (*Section 5*).
5. Appoint Michael Cantlay as Convener of the Social Care Council (*Section 5.1*).
6. Appoint Sonia Blakesley as Convener of the Safeguarding Committee (*Section 5.1*).
7. Reappoint James Stewart as Convener of the Life and Work Advisory Committee (*Section 5.1*).
8. Appoint Robert Hamilton as Convener of the Registration of Ministries Committee (with effect from May 2023) (*Section 5.1*).
9. Reappoint Philip Brodie as Convener of the Appeals Committee of the Commission of Assembly (*Section 5.1*).
10. Appoint Leslie Milton as Convener of the Ministries Appeal Panel (*Section 5.1*).

### Report

## 1. COMMITTEE REMIT AND PROCESS

### 1.1 Preamble

**1.1.1** The remit of the Nomination Committee is to identify Ministers, Deacons, Elders and Members with relevant skills and experience to serve the Standing Committees of the General Assembly. The Nomination Committee works with Standing Committees to ensure that the appointment of Conveners and Vice Conveners is made in a fair and transparent manner. The Nomination Committee also has a role in assisting other bodies with their appointments process.

**1.1.2** The Nomination Committee is grateful to those who have offered their skills to serve the Standing Committees of the General Assembly through the nomination cycle of 2023/24.

**1.1.3** At the time of writing, three vacancies remain unfilled on Standing Committees.

**1.1.4** With the help of the Communications Department, two short videos were distributed to promote the work of the Nomination Committee.

**1.1.5** As in recent years, the Nomination Committee has met online in order to reduce costs and in accordance with the General Assembly's strategy towards a net zero pathway by 2030.

### 1.2 Faith Action Programme Leadership Team

**1.2.1** The Nomination Committee was saddened to hear of the passing of Richard Lloyd after a short illness. Richard served as Leader of the Mission Support Programme Group and in that capacity as a Vice Convener of FAPLT. The Nomination Committee is grateful that Jonathan Fleming has been willing to take on that role.

### 1.3 Appointments to Legal Bodies

**1.3.1** The Committee received names at its January/February meeting from the Convener of the Legal Questions Committee, Principal Clerk and Depute Principal Clerk.

### 1.4 Nomination of the Moderator Committee

**1.4.1** Under a new process introduced by the General Assembly of 2023 for appointments to the Nomination of the Moderator Committee, the Nomination Committee received the names of two potential nominees from each Presbytery. While this generally worked well, the Nomination Committee hopes in future years to offer guidance to Presbyteries about the process to be followed for identifying potential nominees and to invite the Presbyteries to provide to the Nomination Committee more detail of each potential nominee.

## 2. NEW APPOINTMENTS TO THE ASSEMBLY TRUSTEES AND SUB-COMMITTEES

### 2.1 Background

**2.1.1** The work of the Nomination Committee has evolved as the role of the Assembly Trustees and sub-Committees (the Seeds for Growth Committee and the Equality, Diversity and Inclusion (EDI) Group) has developed. The Nomination Committee is not responsible for making appointments to these but plays a role in ensuring that appointments are made in a fair and transparent manner.

### 2.2 Assembly Trustees

**2.2.1** The Nomination Committee is satisfied that new appointments being proposed by the Assembly Trustees have been made in a fair and transparent manner.

## **2.3 Seeds for Growth Committee**

**2.3.1** A representative from the Nomination Committee was present when the Seeds for Growth Committee met and selected nominees for mid-term appointments. The Nomination Committee is satisfied that the process was fair and transparent.

## **2.4 EDI Group**

**2.4.1** A representative from the Nomination Committee was present when the EDI Group met and selected nominees for new appointments. The Nomination Committee is satisfied that the process was fair and transparent.

---

## **3. STRATEGIC REVIEW OF THE NOMINATIONS PROCESS**

### **3.1 Background**

**3.1.1** In 2023, the support and coordination of the nominations process and the work of the Nomination Committee moved from the Office of Assembly Trustees to the Office of the General Assembly. There were also staffing changes in relation to the Nomination Committee, with the appointment of a new Secretary and Support Administrator. The Nomination Committee took this opportunity of change to invite the General Assembly to approve a review of the nominations process. At the General Assembly of 2023, the following section of deliverance was agreed: "Instruct the Nomination Committee to carry out a strategic review of the General Assembly's nomination process and put forward proposals for reform to the General Assembly of 2024".

### **3.2 Strategic Review Group**

**3.2.1** A Strategic Review Group was formed by the Nomination Committee, comprising the Convener, Vice Convener, Secretary, Administrator and a member of the Nomination Committee, along with the Liaison Trustee from the Assembly Trustees and the Secretary of the Assembly and Presbytery Clerks Forum. At the time of writing, the Strategic Review Group has met five times, on one occasion with the Principal Clerk also present.

**3.2.2** The Strategic Review Group identified six areas of work in order to scope the review:

- the internal working of the Nomination Committee;
- sources of information;
- the recruitment process and engagement with the wider Church;
- eligibility for membership of Standing Committees and other bodies;
- working with Conveners of Standing Committees and other bodies; and
- working with the new enlarged Presbyteries.

**3.2.3** The Strategic Review Group has to date focused primarily on the first two areas of work. It is satisfied that the Nomination Committee generally works well in fulfilling its remit in an effective way. In particular it has a clear sense of the responsibility and privilege it holds of serving the wider Church in populating Standing Committees and of the wisdom and care needed in making decisions and in dealing with individuals who step forward to make an application for a Standing Committee, including those who are not nominated as well as those who are successful in their application.

**3.2.4** There are two main meetings of the Nomination Committee each year, with an introductory meeting in September to plan the recruitment process for the year ahead and a two-day meeting in January/February to consider applications. The behind the scenes work throughout the year of advertising and recruitment, of making mid-year appointments and of liaising with other Committees and bodies and with Presbyteries means that the work of the Nomination Committee is administratively heavy and the various processes can be time consuming for staff, Conveners and members of the Nomination Committee. With this in mind, it was decided that it would not be advantageous to reduce the size of the Nomination Committee, although this will continue to be kept under review.

**3.2.5** The regulations for the work of the Nomination Committee are mainly embedded in the Standing Orders of the General Assembly, supplemented by specific rules, customs and practices, only some of which are documented. The Nomination Committee is satisfied that good practice is followed, but it can be time consuming dealing with different sources of information, especially as there is no single process for making appointments to the various Standing Committees and other bodies. To assist with this, the Nomination Committee plans to put together a Nominations Handbook which would set out in one place the law and good practice for the work of the Nomination Committee.

### **3.3 Looking Ahead**

**3.3.1** The work of the Strategic Review Group is not complete and it is hoped to consult with other Committees and bodies, with Presbyteries and with the wider Church in the coming year about other aspects of its work. Further recommendations may be brought to the General Assembly of 2025.

## **4. FACTS AND FIGURES**

### **4.1 General**

**4.1.1** A total of 71 proposed nominees were considered, with several individuals proposed for more than one Standing Committee or other body.

**4.1.2** From the application forms submitted, 40% of potential nominees had heard about the nomination process through e-mail directly from the Nomination Committee, 20% had heard of the process through a member of the Nomination Committee, and others had heard through their Minister, Session Clerk, Presbytery Clerk or Facebook.

**4.1.3** From the application forms submitted, almost 50% of potential nominees had not served on a General Assembly Committee in the past 10 years.

**4.1.4** From the application forms submitted, 90% of potential nominees indicated that their preference to attend meetings was “either online or in person”, while a small number preferred “online only” or “in person” only.

**4.1.5** From the application forms submitted, 19% of potential nominees were under the age of 45, 50% were aged 45-64 and 21% were in the age band of 65 or over.

**4.1.6** Of the supporting forms submitted, 62% came from Ministers, 26% from Standing Committees, 10% from Kirk Session and 22% from Presbyteries.

## **5. NOMINATIONS FOR APPOINTMENT TO STANDING COMMITTEES**

**5.1** The Nomination Committee recommends the following appointments:

*\* denotes a reappointment*

### **Assembly Business Committee**

*Minister Retiring* Douglas Reid

*Member Retiring* James Houston

*Members Appointed* Chloe Clemmons (Edinburgh: Portobello and Joppa), Neil Proven (Edinburgh: Corstorphine St Anne's)

### **Audit Committee**

*Minister Resigned* Graeme Glover

### **Chaplains to HM Forces Committee**

*Member Retiring* Jacqueline Thomson DCS

### **Committee to Nominate the Moderator**

*Ministers and Deacons Appointed* Hayley Cohen (Musselburgh: Northesk), Mark Evans DCS (Edinburgh: Colinton), Audrey Jamieson (Glasgow: Drumchapel St Mark's), Gordon Kennedy (Edinburgh: Craiglockhart), Margaret McArthur (Cardross), John McMahon (West London Mental Health Trust), Colin Strong (Mormond West)

*Elders Appointed* Gayle Lennon (Cupar: St John's and Dairsie United), Christine Mackenzie (Inverness: Old High St Stephen's), Heather McDonald (Ardoch linked with Blackford), Harry Sergeant (Larbert: West), Violet Service (Gatehouse and Borgue linked with Tarff and Twynholm)

### **Ecumenical Relations Committee**

*Ministers Retiring* Nikki Macdonald, Gary Peacock

*Ministers Appointed* Conor Fegan (Markinch and Thornton), Pauline Steenbergen (Carlisle, Presbytery of the South West)

### **Ethical Oversight Committee**

*Member Resigned* Andrew Wells Aug 2023

*Minister Appointed* Justin Taylor (Guernsey: St Andrew's in the Grange) (2yrs)

### **Faith Action Programme**

#### **-Leadership Team**

*Vice-Convener Resigned* Richard Lloyd Dec 2023

*Vice-Convener Appointed* Jonathan Fleming Dec 2023 (Greenock: Lyle Kirk)

*Minister from Presbytery Resigned* Lynsey Brennan Sep 2023

*Minister from Presbytery Appointed* James McNay Sep 2023 (West Kilbride, Presbytery of the South West)

#### **-Mission Support Programme Group**

*Minister Resigned* Jonathan Fleming Dec 2023

*Minister Appointed* George Sneddon (East Kilbride: Mossneuk) (3yrs)

#### **-Resource and Presence Programme Group**

*Minister Resigned* Neil Meyer May 2023

*Minister Appointed* Teri Peterson May 2023 (Gourock: St John's)

### **Iona Community Board**

*Minister Retiring* Willie Strachan

*Minister Appointed* Liz Johnson Blythe (Glasgow: Castlemilk and Glasgow: Carmunnock)

### **Legal Questions Committee**

*Vice-Convener Retiring* Alan Reid

*Vice-Convener Appointed* Katherine Taylor (Tranent) (1yr)

*Minister Resigned* Euan Glen Jun 2023

*Ministers Appointed* Janet Mathieson Oct 2023 (Williamwood), Douglas Reid (Edinburgh: Palmerston Place) (1yr)

*Ministers Retiring* Janet Mathieson, Katherine Taylor

*Member Resigned* Robert McDougall Aug 2023

*Members Retiring* David McClements, Andrew Gibb

*Members Appointed* Wendy Culross (Hamilton Old), David McClements\* (Falkirk: Trinity), James McLean (Edinburgh: St Cuthbert's) (1yr)

### **Appointment to Legal Bodies**

#### **-Appeals Committee of the Commission of Assembly**

*Convener Retiring* Philip Brodie

*Convener Appointed* Philip Brodie\* (Edinburgh High (St Giles'))

#### **-Discipline Tribunal**

*Vice-Convener Resigned* Jonathan Brodie May 2023

*Vice-Convener Appointed* Kirsty Hood May 2023

#### **-Judicial Commission**

*Vice-Convener Resigning* William Hewitt

*Vice-Convener Appointed* Elspeth McKay (Devana)

#### **-Judicial Panel**

*Minister Resigned* Marjory MacLean May 2023

*Ministers Retiring* John Christie, Robin Hill

*Ministers Appointed* John Christie\* (Paisley: Oakshaw Trinity), Robin Hill\* (Gladsmuir linked with Longniddry)

*Elders Retiring* David Alexander, William Imlay, Leslie Moffat, Sam Scobie

*Elders Appointed* Gordon Aitken Jul 2023 (Bearsden: Cross), David Alexander\* (Uddingston: Viewpark), William Imlay\* (Newport-on-Tay), Leslie Moffat\* (Formartine), Sam Scobie\* (Kirkcowan linked with Wigtown)

#### **-Ministries Appeal Panel**

*Convener Retiring* Robin Stimpson

*Convener Appointed* Leslie Milton (Musselburgh: St Andrew's High)

*Vice-Convener Resigning* Leslie Milton

*Vice-Convener Appointed* Janet Mathieson (Williamwood)

*Minister Retiring* Amos Chewachong

*Member Retiring* Andrew Gibb

*Minister Appointed* Amos Chewachong\* (Newport-on-Tay)

*Member Appointed* Andrew Gibb\* (Edinburgh: Corstorphine St Ninian's)

#### **-Mission Plan Review Group**

*Minister Resigned* George Whyte Aug 2023

*Ministers Appointed* Euan Glen Jul 2023 (Bennachie), Iain May Sep 2023 (Edinburgh: Leith South)

*Pro Tem Substitute Member Appointed* Roger Dodd Oct 2023 (Coldstream and District Parishes linked with Eccles and Leitholm)

#### **-Personnel Appeal Group**

*Minister Resigned* Norman Smith May 2023

#### **Life & Work Advisory Committee**

*Convener Retiring* James Stewart

*Convener Appointed* James Stewart\* (Perth: Letham St Mark's) (1yr)

*Ministers Retiring* Ewen Gilchrist, John Paterson

*Ministers Appointed* Rosemary Frew (Bowden and Melrose), John Paterson\* (Lugar linked with Old Cumnock: Old), David Pitkeathly (London: St Columba's linked with Newcastle: St Andrews)

#### **Nomination Committee**

*Minister Resigning* Moira Taylor-Wintersgill

*Ministers Appointed* Jillian Storie (Wishaw: Cambusnethan North), Kerr Wintersgill (Birsay, Harray and Sandwick, and Stromness)

*Members Retiring* Christine Mackenzie, David Murie

*Member Appointed* David Lloyd (Brussels: St Andrew's)

**Registration of Ministries Committee**

*Convener Appointed* Robert Hamilton May 2023 (Bothwell) (2yrs)

*Vice-Convener Retiring* Hilary McDougall

*Vice-Convener Appointed* Hilary McDougall\* (Cambuslang) (1yr)

**Safeguarding Committee**

*Convener Retiring* Adam Dillon

*Convener Appointed* Sonia Blakesley (Paisley: St Mark's Oldhall)

*Vice-Convener Resigned* Fiona Reynolds May 2023

*Vice-Convener Appointed* Judy Wilson May 2023 (Cardross) (1yr)

*Vice-Convener Retiring* Judy Wilson

*Vice-Convener Appointed* Judy Wilson\* (Cardross)

*Ministers Retiring* Elspeth McKay, Sonia Blakesley

*Member Resigned* Judy Wilson May 2023

*Member Retiring* Robert McCabe

*Members Appointed* Doreen Henderson (Kilmore and Oban) (1yr), Natasha Hepburn (Arbuthnott, Bervie and Kinneff), Corinne Morrison-Gillies (Edinburgh: Portobello and Joppa)

**Social Care Council - CrossReach Board**

*Convener Retiring* Thomas Riddell

*Convener Appointed* Mike Cantlay (Callander)

*Vice-Convener Retiring* Mike Cantlay

*Vice-Convener Appointed* Douglas Hamilton (Traprain) (2yrs)

*Minister Retiring* Douglas Hamilton

*Minister Appointed* Iain Greenshields (Dunfermline: St Margaret's)

*Members Resigning* Lorna Gilhooly, Susie Lind

*Member Appointed* Iain Hunter (Aberdeen: Mannofield)

**Theological Forum**

*Minister Resigned* Rebecca Bartocho Dec 2023

*Minister Retiring* Lance Stone

*Minister Appointed* Moira Taylor-Wintersgill (Birsay, Harray and Sandwick, and Stromness)

*Member Retiring* Glen Pettigrove

*Members Appointed* Alasdair Macleod March 2024 (Strathnairn and Strathdearn) (3yrs), Glen Pettigrove\* (Milngavie: Cairns)

*In the name of the Committee*

ANDREW GARDNER, *Convener*  
BRYAN KERR, *Vice-Convener*  
VICTORIA LINFORD, *Secretary*