

NOMINATION COMMITTEE

May 2017

PROPOSED DELIVERANCE

The General Assembly:

1. Receive the Report.
2. Instruct the Council of Assembly to facilitate conversations among the Nomination Committee, the Legal Questions Committee and senior officers of the Church to recommend whether a better alternative method may be put in place for the nomination of persons to serve on bodies dealing with specific legal matters and report to the General Assembly in 2018. (*Section 2*)
3. Make alterations to Standing Committees and Councils as set forth in the Report. (*Section 6*)

REPORT

1. Background

1.1 The remit of the Nomination Committee is to identify ministers, deacons, elders and members with particular skills and experience for serving on the Church's Councils and Committees. The Committee is grateful to all of those who serve the Church in this way, giving of their time and talents and bringing to the table their understanding of the local Church, their professional skills and expertise, and their passion for the Gospel.

1.2 There are over 400 places on national Councils and Committees, with at least 100 places to fill every year. Names are invited from Kirk Sessions, Presbyteries, Ministers, The Guild, Councils, Committees and individuals in the autumn of each year, and the Committee would wish to thank all of those who consider this matter and identify people for possible involvement.

1.3 Commissioners are invited to think about the work of the Councils and Committees of the Church as reported

to the General Assembly; if they know of someone who would be interested in the work and who could make a contribution, then please consider nominating them in future years. As ever, it would be a particular pleasure to receive more nominations of younger people, but we would also like to hear from people in other under-represented groups (eg those from Priority Area congregations; people of disability; members of ethnic minority groups). There is a short video clip about Council and Committee membership on the Church website at: http://www.churchofscotland.org.uk/about_us/councils_committees_and_departments/committees/nomination_committees.

1.4 The names of those contained in Section 6 are recommended to the General Assembly with a view to filling all of the current vacancies. The names include those appointed to fill vacancies which occurred in Councils and Committees during the course of the 2016-2017 session. The Church owes a debt of gratitude to all of those listed.

2. Nomination of Members to 'Legal' Committees

The Committee, at its meeting in January, discussed with the Convener of the Legal Questions Committee the particular challenge of attracting nominations from the wider church to the Panels, Committees and Commissions of the Church which deal with a variety of legal matters. These bodies are often involved in highly sensitive, specialised work and very specific skills and experience are needed. The right people are not always known to the Nomination Committee, in the absence of recommendations from the wider Church, and the onus has been on the Legal Questions Committee to come up with possible names for consideration. Whilst this practice is permitted, and the Legal Questions Committee is well placed to know what skills and experience are needed for each of the bodies in question, the Nomination Committee asks the Council of Assembly to facilitate a conversation between the Committee, the Legal Questions Committee and senior officers to discuss whether a different process might be needed for bringing forward nominations to these bodies.

3. Barriers to Involvement

3.1 The General Assembly of 2015 instructed the Committee, in partnership with the Council of Assembly and other relevant Councils or Committees, to explore the barriers involved for people in employment and students in becoming members of a Council or Committee and how these can be minimised to allow greater participation and diversity and report back to a future General Assembly. The Committee brought an interim report to the 2016 General Assembly.

3.2 Consideration of these matters is continuing and, at the time of writing, the Committee is planning to conduct a short questionnaire in a sample group of congregations from across the country, aided by the Rev Dr Fiona Tweedie, Mission Statistics Co-ordinator. The Committee is also considering the use of technology and the potential for greater participation in meetings from remote locations, and has invited one of its members who has

relevant experience from the business world to present a paper to its next meeting.

3.3 Whilst the Committee will continue to research the practical barriers to involvement, it remains of the view that the Church's complex governance structure and its reliance on meetings lie at the heart of this matter and that these are issues requiring reflection by the whole Church. We acknowledge that the Council of Assembly's current work on bringing forward a strategic plan may have a bearing on the future structure and workings of the Church's national committees and await that outcome before making any further recommendations.

4. Statistical Information

4.1 The Committee provides some statistical details to the Assembly as a means of highlighting and encouraging the engagement of the Church as a whole with the Nomination Committee process.

4.2 Approximately 3,000 e-mails inviting nominations were sent out to Ministers, Session Clerks, Presbytery Clerks, the National Office of the Guild, members of the Nomination Committee and Secretaries of Assembly Councils and Committees.

4.3 These letters produced a total of 209 proposed nominations, broken down as follows (with some individuals proposed for more than one committee, and some forms supported by more than one category eg Minister and Kirk Session):

- 45 nominations from 27 Ministers (compared with 52 from 28 last year and 39 from 26 in 2015), with 20 being approached;
- 32 nominations from 18 Kirk Sessions (compared with 9 from 6 last year and 19 from 10 in 2015), with 8 being approached;
- 38 nominations from 13 Presbyteries (compared with 17 from 6 last year and 21 from 9 in 2015), with 15 being approached;

- 4 nominations from the Guild (compared with none in 2015 and 2016), with 2 being approached;
- 6 nominations from Nomination Committee members (compared with 7 last year and 13 in 2015), with 5 being approached;
- 82 nominations from Councils and Committees (compared with 102 last year and 97 in 2015), with 66 being approached.

4.4 A total of 116 vacancies required to be filled this year.

5. Charity Governance

5.1 The voting members of the Council of Assembly are the General Assembly's designated charity trustees for the Unincorporated Councils and Committees (The Church of Scotland, Scottish Charity Number SC011353). The Nomination Committee is charged with implementing an open recruitment process for new Trustees as set out in 2010 by the Special Committee on the Review of Charity Governance.

5.2 The Nomination Committee arranged for an advertisement to be placed in *Life and Work* and on the Church's website, seeking applications for trustee vacancies. Interviews for shortlisted candidates were held in December, with the Nomination Committee providing the chairman and members of the interview panel and the Convener and Secretary of the Council of Assembly attending as observers. The nominations for two new members are contained within Section 6 along with a proposed reappointment. The Nomination Committee wishes to thank the applicants who so willingly submitted themselves to a rigorous recruitment exercise.

6. Nominations for Appointment to Councils and Committees

6.1 The Committee wishes to nominate Philip Brodie for a second term, for three years, as one of the Conveners of the Appeals Committee of the Commission of Assembly. This reappointment can only be made if the General

Assembly agree to suspend Standing Order 122 and it is anticipated that the Business Convener will arrange for that question to be put to the Assembly at an appropriate point in the proceedings.

6.2 The Committee recommends the following appointments:

** denotes second term*

Appeals Committee of the Commission of Assembly

Convener Retiring Carole Hope

Conveners Appointed Philip Brodie* (Edinburgh: High (St Giles')) (3 yrs) *subject to the General Assembly suspending Standing Order 122*, Alan Hamilton (Bearsden: Killermont)

Vice-Convener Appointed Grahame Lees (Dunblane: Cathedral)

Philip Brodie, Alan Hamilton, *Conveners*
Helen Jamieson, Grahame Lees, *Vice-Conveners*

Arbitration Panel

Member Retiring Colin Armstrong

Assembly Arrangements Committee

Convener Retired Derek Browning

Convener Appointed Judith Pearson (Aberdeen: Queen's Cross) (from March 2017)

Vice Convener Appointed Fiona Smith (Inverness: Ness Bank) (from March 2017)

Minister Retiring Neil Gardner

Ministers Appointed Alexander Horsburgh (Dalkeith: St Nicholas' Buccleuch), Gillian Paterson (Methil: Wellesley)

Judith Pearson, *Convener*
Fiona Smith, *Vice-Convener*

Audit Committee

Minister Appointed Gary Peacock (Irongray, Lochrutton and Terregles)

Member Retiring Charles Scott

Grant Macrae, *Convener*

Chaplains to HM Forces Committee

Vice-Convener Retiring John Murdoch

Vice-Convener Appointed Carolyn Macleod (Bracadale and Duirinish)

Minister Retiring Scott Rae

Minister Resigned David Gemmell

Ministers Appointed John Duncan (Leuchars: St Athernase), Fiona Ogg (Acharacle I/w Ardnamurchan), Lisa-Jane Rankin (Hawick: Wilton I/w Teviothead)

Member Retiring Jo Young

Member Appointed Ethne Brown (Lochgelly and Benarty: St Serf's)

Gordon Craig, *Convener*
Carolyn Macleod, *Vice-Convener*

Church Art and Architecture Committee

Ministers Retiring David Logan, Harry Mowbray

Ministers Appointed Harry Mowbray* (Blairgowrie), Wayne Pearce (Stornoway: High)

Member Retiring Alice Merilees

Member Resigned William Riddick

Members Appointed Andrew McCreath (Aberdeen: Midsocket) (1 yr), Alice Merilees* (Aberdeen: Kirk of St Nicholas Uniting)

William Hogg, *Convener*
James Alexander, *Vice-Convener*

Church and Society Council

Ministers Retiring Valerie Allen, Alan Hamilton-Messer, Peter Nimmo, John Povey

Minister Appointed Peter Nimmo* (Inverness: Old High St Stephen's)

Members Retiring John McConnachie, Iain Mitchell, Glenn Walker

Members Appointed Sheila Brumby (Roths), Gordon Mackay (Aberdalgie and Forteviot), John McConnachie* (Bellie and Speymouth), Elizabeth Mclachlan (Carluke: Kirkton), Gordon Sharp (Dundee: West), William Walker (Edinburgh: Greyfriars Kirk)

Richard Frazer, *Convener*
Pauline Edmiston, Wendy Young, *Vice-Conveners*

Council of Assembly

Members Retiring Elizabeth Fox, Anne Lamont

Member Resigned Hilary Cameron

Members Appointed Alistair Gibb (Edinburgh: Cramond), Anne Lamont* (Edinburgh: Leith North), Ronald Wright (Dunblane: Cathedral)

Sally Bonnar, *Convener*
Catherine Coull, *Vice-Convener*

Ecumenical Relations Committee

Convener Reappointed Alison McDonald* (Musselburgh: Northesk) (1 yr)

Minister Retiring Aniko Schütz Bradwell

Minister Resigned Glenn Chestnutt

Ministers Appointed Ross Blackman (Hamilton: Old) (2 yrs), Aniko Schütz Bradwell* (Humbie I/w Yester, Boulton and Saltoun)

Alison McDonald, *Convener*
Calum MacLeod, *Vice-Convener*

Judicial Commission

Ministers Retiring Christine Goldie, Bruce McNicol, Fiona Smith, Stuart Smith

Ministers Appointed Marian Cowie (Aberdeen: South Holburn), Gordon McCracken (Clerk to the Presbytery of Hamilton), Jan Mathieson (Glasgow: Williamwood), MaryAnn Rennie (Dunfermline: Abbey)

Elders Retiring Robin Braidwood, John Crichton, Angus Hogg, Isabell Montgomerie, Nigel Orr, James Wallace

Elders Appointed Steuart Dey (Kilmarnock: New Laigh Kirk), Chris Dunn (Cumbernauld: Kildrum), Douglas Hamill (Kirkcaldy: Linktown), Pauline Weibye (Edinburgh: Craigmillar Park)

Robert Brodie, Morag Mylne, *Conveners*
David Lunan, Colin Renwick, *Vice-Conveners*

Judicial Proceedings Panel

Ministers Retiring Alan Hamilton, Alistair May, Val Ott, Sally Russell, Lindsay Schlüter, David Sutherland, Alison Swindells

Ministers Appointed Alan Hamilton* (Bearsden: Killermont), Alistair May* (Rutherglen: Stonelaw), Val Ott* (Gatehouse and Borgue I/w Tarff and Twynholm), Thomas Pollock (Glasgow: Sherbrooke St Gilbert's), Sally Russell* (Corsock and Kirkpatrick Durham I/w Crossmichael, Parton and Balmaghie), Lindsay Schlüter* (Barra I/w South Uist), David Sutherland* (Dumfries: Maxwelltown West)

Elders Retiring Veronica Crerar

Legal Questions Committee

Minister Appointed Adam Dillon (Kirkpatrick Juxta I/w Moffat: St Andrew's I/w Wamphray)

Member Retiring James McLean

Member Appointed James McLean* (Edinburgh: St Cuthbert's)

George Cowie, *Convener*
Alistair May, *Vice-Convener*

Life and Work Advisory Group

Minister Retiring James Stewart

Minister Appointed James Stewart* (Perth: Letham St Mark's)

Member Retiring Bill Livingstone

Member Resigned Bill McIntosh

Members Appointed Tina Kemp (Presbytery of Dumbarton), Andrew Nicoll (Dundee: Broughty Ferry New Kirk)

John Ferguson, *Convener*

Ministries Appeal Panel

Vice-Convener Retiring Carole Hope

Vice-Convener Appointed Robin Stimpson (Edinburgh: Morningside)

Member Appointed Isabell Montgomerie (Ochiltree)

David Arnott, *Convener*
Robin Stimpson, *Vice-Convener*

Ministries Council

Vice-Conveners Retiring Colin Brough, Marjory MacLean, Derek Pope

Vice-Conveners Appointed David McLachlan (Glasgow: Langside), Eleanor McMahon (Glasgow: Govan and Linthouse), Sarah Ross (Blantyre: Old)

Ministers Retiring David McLachlan, Leslie Milton, Val Ott, Sarah Ross, Terry Taylor, James Teasdale

Ministers Resigned Glen Chestnutt, Hilary McDougall

Ministers Appointed Ian McDonald (Lausanne), Moira McDonald (Edinburgh: Corstorphine Old), Peter MacDonald (Cockenzie and Port Seton: Chalmers Memorial Member), Alison Notman (Ardler Kettins and Meikle), James Teasdale* (Glasgow: Eastwood)

Members Retiring Anne Noble, Allan Sim

Members Appointed Scott Burton (Edinburgh: Holy Trinity), Hilary Peppiette (Edinburgh: Fairmilehead), Allan Sim* (Edinburgh: St Andrew's and St George's West) (1 yr)

Neil Glover, *Convener*

John Dent, David McLachlan,

Eleanor McMahon, Sarah Ross, *Vice-Conveners*

Mission and Discipleship Council

Vice-Convener Reappointed Daniel Carmichael* (Lenzie: Union) (1 yr)

Ministers Retiring Fiona Bullock, Daniel Manastireanu, Abi Ngunga

Ministers Appointed Marc Bircham (St Madoes and Kinfauns), Andrea Boyes (Larkhall: Chalmers), Fiona Bullock* (Dun and Hillside)

Members Resigned Elspeth McCallum, Iain McLarty

Members Appointed Murdo Macmillan* (Auchterarder), Andrew Simpson (Macduff)

Norman Smith, *Convener*

Daniel Carmichael, Martin Fair,

Jamie Milliken, *Vice-Conveners*

Nomination Committee

Convener Retiring Kenneth Stott

Convener Appointed Lynsey Kimmitt (Dundee: Coldside)

Vice-Convener Retiring Ann Lyall DCS

Vice-Convener Appointed John Collard (Coatbridge: Blairhill Dundyvan I/w Coatbridge: Middle)

Ministers Retiring Mark Nicholas, Muriel Willoughby, Andrew Wilson

Ministers Appointed Catherine Buchan (Laggan I/w Newtonmore), Karen Harbison (Greenock: Westburn), Andrew Philip (Crieff), Lezley Stewart (Edinburgh: Greyfriars Kirk), Colin Sutherland (Dumfries: St George's)

Members Retiring Irene Crosthwaite, Marian Macintyre, Elspeth Smith

Member Resigned Alasdair Maclean

Members Appointed Barbara Leppard (Dunfermline: St Leonard's), Andrew MacPherson (Broxburn), Elspeth McPheat DCS (Presbytery of Edinburgh), John Stewart (Paisley: Oakshaw Trinity)

Lynsey Kimmitt, *Convener*

John Collard, *Vice-Convener*

Panel on Review and Reform

Vice-Convener Retiring David Cameron

Vice-Convener Appointed Jennifer Adams (Duffus, Spynie and Hopeman)

Minister Retiring Gordon McCracken

Minister Appointed Alistair Cumming (London: St Columba's)

Member Appointed Ross Watters (Gorebridge)

Graham Duffin, *Convener*

Jennifer Adams, *Vice-Convener*

Registration of Ministries Committee *(subject to the General Assembly establishing this Committee)*

Convener Appointed Neil Dougall (North Berwick: St Andrew Blackadder)

Vice-Convener Appointed Hazel Hastie (Edinburgh: Drylaw)

Minister Appointed Marjory MacLean (Abernyte l/w Inchtute and Kinnaird l/w Longforgan) (2 yrs)

Neil Dougall, *Convener*
Hazel Hastie, *Vice-Convener*

Safeguarding Appeal Panel

Members Appointed Sheena-Jane Clark (London: St Columba's), David Dick (Closeburn), Hugh McGregor (Larkhall: Trinity), Anne Noble (Bathgate: St John's)

Solicitor of the Church, *Secretary*

Safeguarding Committee

Vice-Convener Retiring Sheila Ritchie

Vice-Convener Appointed Caroline Deerin (Biggar)

Minister Appointed David Logan (Caerlaverock l/w Dumfries: St Mary's-Greyfriars')

Karen Campbell, *Convener*
Caroline Deerin, *Vice-Convener*

Social Care Council

Vice-Convener Resigned Richard Begg

Vice-Convener Appointed Irene McGugan (Dunnichen, Letham and Kirkden)

Ministers Retiring David Gray, Ramsay Shields

Minister Resigned Kenneth Russell

Ministers Appointed David Gray* (Dundee: Logie and St John's (Cross)), George Mackay (Glasgow: Broomhill l/w Glasgow Hyndland), Ramsay Shields* (Milngavie: St Luke's)

Members Retiring Adrian Bark, Martha Bogle, Mary Ford, Brenda Graham, Kathleen MacPherson, Sheila Robertson, Bill Usher

Members Appointed Martha Bogle* (Bo'ness: St Andrew's), Peter Donaldson (Inverurie: St Andrew's), Mary Ford* (Stevenston: High), John Graham (Edinburgh: Mayfield Salisbury), Iain Hunter (Aberdeen: Mannofield), Sheila Robertson* (Cromar), Sarah Wood (Ceres, Kemback and Springfield), Alan Young (Netherlee)

Bill Steele, *Convener*
Irene McGugan, Hugh Stewart, *Vice-Conveners*

Theological Forum

Convener Retiring Iain Torrance

Convener Appointed Donald MacEwan (Chaplain University of St Andrews)

Vice-Convener Appointed Sarah Lane Ritchie (Edinburgh: Greyfriars Kirk)

Minister Resigned Glenn Chestnutt

Ministers Appointed Jean Kirkwood (Dunfermline: Townhill and Kingseat), Paul Middleton (University Lecturer, Presbytery of England), Alastair Symington (Troon: Old *retired*)

Member Retiring Anette Hagan

Donald MacEwan, *Convener*
Sarah Lane Ritchie, *Vice-Convener*

World Mission Council

Vice-Convener Retiring Valerie Brown

Vice-Convener Appointed Maureen Jack (St Andrews: St Leonard's)

Ministers Retiring Alison Burnside, Alistair Donald, Aftab Gohar, Tina Kemp, Aniko Schütz Bradwell

Ministers Appointed Richard Baxter (Fort William: Duncansburgh MacIntosh l/w Kilmonivaig), Kleber Machado (Corby: St Ninian's) (1 yr), Monica Michelin-Salomon (Glasgow: Causeway Tollcross), Ian Stirling (Fisherton l/w Kirkoswald)

Members Retiring Valerie Macniven, Mukami McCrum, Douglas Short

Member Resigned Gillian MacPherson

Members Appointed Rosemary Johnston (Abernethy and Dron and Arngask), Gigha Lennox (Troon: Portland), Valerie Macniven* (Edinburgh: Greenbank), Irene McLellan (Dunfermline: Abbey), Lily Stevenson (Dalbeattie and Kirkgunzeon)

Iain Cunningham, *Convener*
Susan Brown, Maureen Jack, *Vice-Conveners*

In the name of the Committee

KENNETH STOTT, *Convener*
ANN LYALL DCS, *Vice-Convener*
MARTIN SCOTT, *Secretary*

ADDENDUM

Rev Kenny Stott, Convener

Rev Kenny Stott comes to the end of his term as Convener of the Nomination Committee in 2017. Kenny has brought to the Committee his experience of the Church gained from his 28 years in ministry in Partick: South and Dundee: Chalmers-Ardler. He has led the Committee with fairness and openness, encouraging all of the members to contribute and taking on board the variety of opinions voiced around the table. His leadership skills have helped

steer the Committee in balancing the needs of the individual Councils and Committees with the desire for fresh involvement from a wider circle of Church people. His passion for the Gospel and his pragmatism have worked well together in this very practical but strategic area of the Church's work. We ask for God's continued blessing on Kenny's ministry, and thank him for his dedicated service on the Nomination Committee.

Ann Lyall DCS, Vice-Convener

Ann Lyall DCS completes a three-year term as Vice-Convener of the Nomination Committee, having been a member of the Committee since 2012. Ann's involvement in both the Diaconate and the Interim Ministries Team has benefited the Committee in terms of her personal knowledge of people from a variety of backgrounds and geographical locations across the Church. She has been persistent in her encouragement to the Church and the Committee to consider 'new' people for nomination, and has often been relied upon to suggest names from her wide network for those difficult-to-fill places. Ann has challenged the Committee in its thinking and that has been of great benefit. We pray God's blessing on Ann and her continued work within Interim Ministry.

MARTIN SCOTT, *Secretary*