

NOMINATION COMMITTEE MAY 2022

Proposed Deliverance

The General Assembly:

1. Receive the Report.
2. The Standing Committees and each of the Presbyteries are encouraged to invite members of Standing Committees to speak to Presbytery about the benefits of serving the wider Church and subsequently encouraged to generate nominations. *(Section 1.2)*
3. Make alterations to the Standing Committees of the General Assembly as set forth in the Report. *(Section 7)*
4. Appoint David Di Paola and John Wilson, both solicitors in the Law Dept, as Assessors in terms of the Discipline Act (Act I 2019). *(Section 7.1)*
5. Reappoint Roddy John MacLeod as a Convener of the Discipline Tribunal. *(Section 7.2)*
6. Reappoint Ian Miller as a Convener of the Discipline Tribunal. *(Section 7.2)*
7. Reappoint Richard McFarlane as a Convener of the Judicial Commission. *(Section 7.2)*
8. Reappoint Morag Ross as a Convener of the Judicial Commission. *(Section 7.2)*
9. Appoint Kenneth Baldwin as Convener of the Audit Committee. *(Section 7.4)*
10. Appoint Scott Brown as Convener of the Chaplains to Her Majesty's Forces Committee. *(Section 7.4)*
11. Appoint Ross Blackman as Convener of the Ecumenical Relations Committee. *(Section 7.4)*

Report

1. COMMITTEE REMIT AND PROCESSES

1.1 Preamble

1.1.1 In an effort to be more creative in the way nominations were sought we introduced this year's invitation with a series of video interviews, with volunteers who have served or are serving; with those who seek to fill vacancies and with the Chief Officer, Dave Kendall. The interviews were edited into short clips and a longer mix that introduced the Nominations process. The recordings were made available on the Church of Scotland website and elicited some good initial responses. We offer grateful thanks to Bryan Kerr, a committee member, for producing the video recordings.

1.1.2 Conveners of the Standing Committees were asked to participate in a webinar on the nominations process on 17 November 2021. This was an opportunity for proposed and potential nominees to hear what is expected of members and to ask questions. Details of the process for nomination and the number of vacancies was provided.

1.1.3 The nomination form was reviewed and edited. Consideration was given to previous experience, service on National Committees and the age brackets set out on the form. From the online nomination forms submitted, one person stated a preference to attend meetings online only. The remainder indicated that they would attend in person or online.

1.1.4 The Communications Department created and developed online content to promote the nominations process.

1.1.5 Sadly, the responses did not lead to an influx of nominations and we were, once again, faced with fewer than we would have liked. Even with low numbers our process was still rigorous. We worked with Conveners to find the best match for their vacancies. Unfortunately, some vacancies remain unfilled. Given the challenges this year, all proposed nominations reported in Section 7 are to serve for a full term, even where the person is being nominated in place of one resigned or of one appointed as Convener or Vice-Convener who would ordinarily serve for the remainder of the period for which the person was appointed whose place they take.

1.2 2021 and Beyond

1.2.1 It seems there is a pattern developing which may or may not be a result of the pandemic. Generally, the Church has had to find new ways to respond and as a result, individuals are overstretched and unable to offer more time for national committees. As we begin to work with the new presbyteries, we hope there may be a revamp of presbytery nominations. Each presbytery has members who serve on national committees and it would be a positive move if each of those could be invited to speak to their presbytery about the positive benefits of serving the wider church and encouraging others to seek nominations.

1.2.2 The work of the Church continues. The need for new ideas, new voices and new people is more urgent than ever. Therefore, the committee seeks multiple strands for the nominations process in 2022-23. We continue to encourage individual nominations but in addition there will be an expectation that the Standing Committees and presbyteries also generate nominations each year. All nominations received will go into a general pool and nominees may be invited to serve elsewhere if the committee feel their gifts can be used.

1.3 Nomination to Legal Bodies

1.3.1 In order to source suitably qualified people, the Safeguarding Appeal Group and the Personnel Appeal Group were added to the list of bodies and included in the nominations process for legal bodies.

1.3.2 The existing six members of the Personnel Appeal Group will continue in post. No nominations to this group are reported below. The Convener has existing delegated authority to fill the six current vacancies should suitable persons be identified by the Solicitor of the Church.

1.3.3 The Mission Plan Review Group has also been included in the nomination process for legal bodies. It was noted that the Legal Questions Committee was in the process of recruiting to this new group. Serving on this group will be an onerous task and recruitment is therefore not straightforward. The Legal Questions Committee seeks authority to continue recruitment with reporting to the Convener and Vice-Convener of the Nomination Committee as names are confirmed. Thirteen of the fifteen names required are reported below with the Convener and Vice-Convener to act under delegated authority to approve further appointments.

1.3.4 The Committee received names at its February meeting as agreed by the Legal Questions Committee, Principal Clerk and Solicitor of the Church.

1.4 Social Care Council's CrossReach Board

1.4.1 The Committee was invited to be part of an interview process for membership of the CrossReach Board. Committee representatives were the Convener and Ian Russell.

2. COMMITTEE TO NOMINATE THE MODERATOR

2.1 There were no nominations for consideration at the committee meeting in February to serve on the Committee to Nominate the Moderator 2023. This was very disappointing. It meant that we needed to consider a new approach. Advice was sought from the Principal Clerk on how to create a membership. Each of the nomination forms received were considered. Standing Committee Conveners who had finished their term of office in the past two years were also considered. Members of the Nomination Committee were encouraged to suggest names as well as put their own name forward for consideration. 15 people were approached to be nominated but not all felt able to accept. After further recruitment, this year's final list of nominees is equally balanced with 7 ministers and deacons and 7 elders.

2.2 Standing Order 119 states that the Nomination Committee shall not nominate for Committees any of its own number except in special circumstances which must be stated to the Assembly. Due to the challenges this year in populating the Committee to Nominate the Moderator an allowance is sought for two proposed nominees to join both the Nomination Committee and the Committee to Nominate the Moderator as well as one existing member of the Nomination Committee to be nominated. A similar exception is also sought in relation to the remits and membership set out for the Forums which state: No Assembly Trustee, member of another Agency of the Church or employee of the Church shall be eligible to be a member. Three of the proposed nominees for the Committee to Nominate the Moderator are also nominated to serve on the Faith Impact Forum.

3. APPOINTMENT OF ASSEMBLY TRUSTEES

3.1 The Nomination Committee Convener and Vice-Convener were consulted on the process and recommendations for appointment of Trustees, to be submitted for approval to the May 2022 General Assembly.

4. APPROPRIATE NUMBER OF GENERAL ASSEMBLY APPOINTED MEMBERS

4.1 Further to the Report of the Nomination Committee in 2021 the General Assembly invited each of the Standing Committees to reconsider its constitution and confirm the appropriate number of General Assembly appointed members which is required.

4.2 Chaplains to Her Majesty's Forces Committee Constitution

4.2.1 As set out in the Nomination Committee Report to the General Assembly in May 2021 the Chaplains to Her Majesty's Forces Committee reviewed its constitution in consultation with the Assembly Trustees and the Nomination Committee. A proposed reduction in membership is included in the Assembly Trustees report to the General Assembly in 2022 for approval.

4.2.2 The Nomination Committee was unable to make enough nominations to fill all vacancies. Based on the proposed reduced membership, the Committee has two vacancies unfilled. Additionally, in March 2022 the Vice-Convener resigned and it is anticipated that a nomination for this vacancy will be brought to the General Assembly for approval in a notice of motion.

5. ASSEMBLY TRUSTEES' EQUALITY, DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION GROUP MEMBERSHIP

5.1 Those who wished to be considered for membership of the Equality, Diversity and Inclusion (EDI) Group of the Assembly Trustees were invited to submit a nomination through the nominations process. The Convener and Andrew Gardner then represented the Committee on a sifting panel also comprising representatives of the Group and the Assembly Trustees. Further to the resignation of the Convener of the EDI Group this vacancy was also considered.

5.2 The suggested appointments were put to the Assembly Trustees in January for approval and the process and results were intimated to the Nomination Committee when they met in February. Further details of the EDI Group are provided on the Church of Scotland's website www.churchofscotland.org.uk/about-us/equality-diversity-and-inclusion-group.

6. FACTS AND FIGURES

- 6.1** Details on facts and figures are provided as a means of highlighting and encouraging the engagement of the Church as a whole with the nominations process. Figures do not include applications received for Charity Trusteeship which is a separate process.
- 6.2** A total of 71 proposed nominees were considered with several individuals proposed for more than one committee.
- 6.2.1** 21 names were received for the nomination process to legal bodies. Nomination forms were not received.
- 6.2.2** 50 nominations were considered for the Standing Committees. Nomination forms were not received from 6 of the nominees for the Committee to Nominate the Moderator. In addition, 1 nominee withdrew due to personal reasons prior to the February meeting and is not included in the totals or below breakdown:
- 12 nominations from Ministers (compared with 34 in 2021 and 58 in 2020), with 9 being approached (plus 2 who were approached to serve on the EDI Group);
 - 1 nomination from a Deacon (the nomination form was edited to include nomination from a Deacon), with 1 being approached;
 - 6 nominations from Kirk Sessions (compared with 13 nominations in 2021 and 14 in 2020), with 4 being approached (plus 1 who was approached to serve on the EDI Group);
 - 1 nomination from Presbyteries (compared with 4 in 2021 and 16 in 2020), with 1 being approached;
 - 0 nominations from The Guild (compared with 1 in 2021 and 1 in 2020);
 - 2 nominations from Nomination Committee members (compared with 4 in 2021 and 2 in 2020), with 2 being approached;
 - 22 nominations from the Standing Committee Convener (compared with 26 in 2021 and 41 in 2020), with 21 being approached (plus 1 who was approached to serve on the EDI Group).
 - A total of 69 vacancies were considered this year for the Standing Committees. 17 vacancies remain unfilled at the time of going to print and the Committee may act under delegated authority to fill some of these.

7. NOMINATIONS FOR APPOINTMENT TO THE STANDING COMMITTEES

- 7.1** The Committee agreed to appoint David Di Paola and John Wilson, both solicitors in the Law Dept, under delegated powers as Assessors in terms of the Discipline Act. The complete current list of Assessors would therefore be Gordon Barclay, David Di Paola and John Wilson, all solicitors in the Law Dept.
- 7.2** The following appointments will require the General Assembly to suspend Standing Order 122. It is anticipated that the Convener of the Procedure Committee will arrange for that question to be put to the General Assembly at the appropriate point in the proceedings.
- 7.2.1** The Committee wishes to nominate Roddy John MacLeod for a further term of four years, as one of the Conveners of the Discipline Tribunal.
- 7.2.2** The Committee wishes to nominate Ian Miller for a further term of four years, as one of the Conveners of the Discipline Tribunal.
- 7.2.3** The Committee wishes to nominate Richard McFarlane for a further term of four years, as one of the Conveners of the Judicial Commission.
- 7.2.4** The Committee wishes to nominate Morag Ross for a further term of four years, as one of the Conveners of the Judicial Commission.
- 7.3** The following appointments will require the General Assembly to suspend Standing Order 118. It is anticipated that the Convener of the Procedure Committee will arrange for that question to be put to the General Assembly at the appropriate point in the proceedings.
- 7.3.1** Both of the members retiring from the Theological Forum have specific skills and experience which are of great benefit at this time and so re-election of both, and therefore more than one-half of the retiring members, is desirable. The Committee wishes to nominate both of the two retiring members for reappointment to serve a second term on the Theological Forum.
- 7.4** The Committee recommends the following appointments:

** denotes a reappointment*

Assembly Business Committee

- Vice-Convener Retiring* Susan Pym
- Vice-Convener Appointed* Michael Mair (Edinburgh: St David’s Broomhouse)
- Minister Resigning* Michael Mair*
- Minister Retiring* Alison Mehigan
- Minister Appointed* Sarah Ross (East Kilbride: Moncreiff)
- Elder Retiring* Graeme Roberts
- Elders Appointed* Graeme Barrie (Glasgow: Easterhouse), Graeme Roberts* (Aberdeen: Ferryhill)

Audit Committee

- Convener Retiring* Andrew Croxford
- Convener Appointed* Kenneth Baldwin (Old Gourrock and Ashton)
- Member Resigning* Kenneth Baldwin

Chaplains to HM Forces Committee

Convener Retiring Marjory MacLean

Convener Appointed Scott Brown (Buchlyvie linked with Gartmore)

Vice-Convener Resigned John Duncan Mar 2022

Vice Convener Appointed Andrew Tait

Ministers Retiring James Aitchison, Shuna Dicks, William McLaren

Minister Appointed William McLaren* (London: St Columba's linked with Newcastle: St Andrew's)

Members Retiring Morag Crawford DCS, Eric Fraser

Committee to Nominate the Moderator

Ministers and Deacons Appointed Hilary Beresford (Kilwinning Mansefield Trinity), Keith Blackwood (Aberdeen Mannofield), Morag Crawford DCS (Edinburgh Drylaw), Karen Hendry (Glasgow Yoker), Bryan Kerr (Lanark: Greyfriars), Angus Morrison (Edinburgh Liberton), Elisabeth Spence (Cockpen and Carrington)

Elders Appointed Sally Bonnar (Perth North), Eddie Colliar (Grangemouth Abbotsgrange), Frances Heafield (Ashkirk), Isabella McDerment (Glasgow Scotstoun), Robert McQuistan (Kirkmabreck), Darren Philip (Livingston United), Michael Yuill (Dunblane St Blane's)

Ecumenical Relations Committee

Convener Retiring Alexander Horsburgh

Convener Appointed Ross Blackman (Hamilton Old)

Minister Resigning Ross Blackman

Minister Retiring John McMahon

Ministers Appointed William McLaren (London: St Columba's linked with Newcastle: St Andrew's), Elisabeth Spence (Cockpen and Carrington)

Member Retiring Pauline Weibye

Member Appointed Pauline Weibye* (Edinburgh: Craigmillar Park)

Faith Impact Forum

Vice-Convener Retiring Alan Miller

Vice-Convener Appointed Karen Hendry (Glasgow: Yoker)

Ministers Retiring Richard Baxter, Stuart Fulton, Karen Hendry

Minister Appointed Iain Majcher (Bothwell), Linda Pollock (Aberluthnott linked with Laurencekirk), William Wishart (Edinburgh: St. Martin's)

Member Resigned Gordon Sharp Feb 2022

Members Retiring Peter Lloyd, Valerie Macniven

Members Appointed Morag Crawford DCS (Edinburgh: Drylaw), Frances Heafield (Ashkirk), Tom Burnham April 2022 (Earlston)

Faith Nurture Forum

Vice-Convener Retiring Karen Campbell

Vice-Convener Appointed Alan Hamilton (Bearsden: Killermont)

Minister Resigning Alan Hamilton

Ministers Retiring Scott McCarthy, Andrew Morrice

Ministers Appointed Scott Blythe (Netherlee and Stamperland), Sheena Orr (West Kirk of Calder)

Members Retiring Richard Lloyd, Ruth Mackenzie

Members Appointed Lynette Jardine (Uddingston Old), Marie Locke (Stronsay Moncur Memorial)

Iona Community Board

Ministers Retiring David McLachlan*, Alan Miller

Ministers Appointed Sarah Brown (Aberdeen St Machar's Cathedral), Alan Miller* (Stirling: Church of the Holy Rude linked with Stirling Viewfield Erskine)

Legal Questions Committee

Member Retiring Richard Henderson

Member Appointed Robert McDougall (Cambuslang)

Appointment to Legal Bodies

-Discipline Tribunal

Conveners Retiring Roddy John MacLeod, Ian Miller*

Conveners Appointed Roddy John MacLeod* (Edinburgh: Greyfriars Kirk), Ian Miller* (Edinburgh: Corstorphine St Ninian's)

Vice-Conveners Retiring Jonathan Brodie, Andrew Stevenson

Vice-Conveners Appointed Jonathan Brodie* (Edinburgh Canongate), Andrew Stevenson* (Glasgow Newlands South)

-Judicial Commission

Conveners Retiring Richard McFarlane, Morag Ross*

Conveners Appointed Richard McFarlane* (St Andrews Holy Trinity), Morag Ross* (Edinburgh: Portobello and Joppa)

Vice-Convener Retiring Colin Renwick*

Vice-Convener Appointed Colin Renwick* (Dunblane Cathedral)

-Judicial Panel

Minister Retiring Catherine Beattie

Minister Appointed Marjory MacLean (South Ronaldsay and Burray)

Elder Retiring Alan Cox

Elder Appointed Alan Cox* (Airdrie: New Wellwynd)

-Judicial Proceedings Panel

All cases under the Discipline of Ministry Act (Act III 2001) are now complete and this Panel is no longer required. All remaining members may therefore be stood down.

Ministers stood down Hugh Conkey*, Sara Embleton, Alan Garrity*, Tom Gordon, Jane Howitt*, Anne Logan, Ian McLean*, Thomas Pollock*, Fiona Smith*

Elders and Deacons stood down Hazel Hastie*, Richard Henderson*, Robert Hynd*, Helen McLeod*, Anne Mulligan DCS*, Aileen Nimmo*, Janette Wilson, William Windram*

-Ministries Appeal Panel

Minister Resigned Catherine Collins Jul 2021

Minister Appointed Amos Chewachong Aug 2021 (Newport-on-Tay)

-Mission Plan Review Group

Ministers Appointed Scott Blythe (Netherlee and Stamperland), Mike Gargrave (Thornliebank), Neil Glover (Aberfeldy linked with Dull and Weem linked with Grantully, Logierait and Strathtay), Graham McWilliams (Fairlie linked with Largs St Columba's), Alison Meikle (Grangemouth: Zetland)

Members Appointed David Alexander (Uddingston Viewpark), David Brackenridge (Peebles: St Andrew's Leckie), Michael Cunliffe (Edinburgh St Andrew's and St George's West), Grahame Lees (Dunblane Cathedral), David Menzies (Tranent), David Robertson (North Berwick St Andrew Blackadder), Donald Thomas (Glasgow: Merrylea), Raymond Young (Perth St Matthew's)

-Safeguarding Appeal Group

Minister Appointed Bryce Calder (Motherwell St Mary's)

Members stood down Mary Coles, David Dick

Life & Work Advisory Committee

Member Retiring Stuart Wilson*

Member Appointed Darren Philip (Livingston United)

Nomination Committee

Vice-Convener Retiring William Wishart

Vice-Convener Appointed Andrew Gardner (Dundee Barnhill St Margaret's)

Ministers Resigned Graham Finch Aug 2021, Paraic Reamonn Mar 2022

Minister Resigning Alison Meikle

Ministers Retiring Andrew Gardner, Alan Greig, Malcolm Kinnear

Minister Appointed Hilary Beresford (Kilwinning Mansefield Trinity)

Member Resigned Iain MacLeod Dec 2021

Members Retiring Mary Gargrave DCS, Isabella McDerment, Ian Russell

Members Appointed Robert McQuistan (Kirkmabreck), Mark Taylor (Glasgow Jordanhill)

Registration of Ministries Committee

Vice-Convener Resigned Fiona Smith Apr 2022

Vice-Convener Appointed Hilary McDougall Apr 2022 (Cambuslang)

Minister Retiring William McLaren

Member Appointed Richard Henderson (Balerno)

Safeguarding Committee

Minister Resigned Morag Muirhead Aug 2021

Ministers Appointed Julia Wiley Nov 2021 (Armada), Malcolm Kinnear (Kinlochleven linked with Nether Lochaber)

Member Retiring John Pears*

Social Care Council - CrossReach Board

Minister Retiring Ramsay Shields

Minister Appointed Keith Blackwood (Aberdeen: Mannofield)

Member Resigning Iain Hunter

Member Retiring John Graham

Member Appointed John Graham* (Edinburgh: Mayfield Salisbury)

Theological Forum

Vice-Convener Resigned Susan Hardman Moore Jan 2022

Vice-Convener Appointed Paul Nimmo (Kemnay)

Ministers Retiring Hector Morrison

Ministers Appointed Hector Morrison* (Inverness: Hilton)

Member Resigning Paul Nimmo

Member Retiring Andrew Torrance

Member Appointed Andrew Torrance* (St Andrews: Holy Trinity)

In the name of the Committee

JULIE RENNICK, Convener
BILL WISHART, Vice-Convener
DAVE KENDALL, Secretary

Addendum

Bill Wishart, Vice-Convenor

Bill began to serve as a member on the Nomination Committee in 2018 before becoming the Vice-Convenor from 2019. He has worked with two convenors, Lynsey Kimmitt and Julie Rennick. Bill has a gift for encouraging and support, he is a strong team player and has been a great asset to the committee's work. His willingness to step up and pick up some of our additional responsibilities has been greatly valued and his good humour and deep faith will be greatly missed by all who have worked with him. We thank him for his service, and wish him well as he continues to serve this church both locally and nationally.

JULIE RENNICK, *Convenor*
DAVE KENDALL, *Secretary*