

NOMINATION COMMITTEE

May 2015

PROPOSED DELIVERANCE

The General Assembly:

1. Receive the Report.
2. Encourage Presbyteries and congregations to consider prayerfully the talents of those known to them and to nominate those who may be able to contribute helpfully to the work of the Church.
3. Appoint the Rev Neil Glover, Minister of Glasgow: Flemington-Hallside as Convener of the Ministries Council. *(Section 4.3)*
4. Appoint the Rev Graham Duffin, Minister of Loanhead as Convener of the Panel on Review and Reform. *(Section 4.3)*
5. Make alterations to Standing Committees and Councils as set forth in the Report. *(Section 5)*

REPORT

1. Background

The remit of the Nomination Committee is to identify ministers, deacons, elders and members with particular skills and experience for serving on the Church's Councils and Committees. The names of those identified are recommended to the General Assembly and we are confident that all of the available positions will be filled. It remains encouraging that the people whose names appear in Section 5 are prepared to serve the Church in this way and we commend their willingness to place their time and their talents at the Church's disposal. Indeed, the Nomination Committee would like to pay tribute to all those who populate the Councils and Committees of the Church. There are over 400 people willingly giving freely of their time and their energies to ensure that the decisions of the General Assembly are fulfilled and that the Church is enabled to spread the Good News. It is humbling and inspiring to work alongside such committed disciples.

2. Committee

2.1 The Committee continues to work hard to encourage the wider Church to submit names for consideration. Councils and Committees can often suggest names themselves but that opens up a risk, no more than that, that the field is narrower than it could be. We urge people of the Church to remember that if they wish a say in how the Church is organised and administered, then they need to engage positively with the nomination process.

2.2 As in 2013, the Committee issued a blank nomination form to every commissioner in 2014 in the hope of attracting some early submissions for the 2015 process. The response rate was low but the exercise did contribute to an increased awareness of the process and it will be repeated in 2015.

2.3 The Committee made it clear that individuals could nominate themselves for membership although we pointed out that every submission should be supported by a minister, Kirk Session, Presbytery or Council/

Committee of the Church. We take this opportunity to invite Commissioners themselves to consider if they would be interested in serving on one of the Councils and Committees whose reports will be presented in May.

2.4 The Committee has continued to make available a short film about membership of Councils and Committees, produced in early 2014; it remains available for viewing on the Church of Scotland website at:

http://www.churchofscotland.org.uk/about_us/councils_committees_and_departments/committees/nomination_committee.

Ministers and Kirk Sessions are encouraged to show the film to their members.

2.5 The Committee can report that its efforts have resulted in a response rate similar to recent years. The statistics are provided in Section 3. The Committee continues to be concerned about widening access to the Church's committees, particularly to younger people who are not generally free to attend day-time meetings. While some of our younger people are very willing to give of their time in the evenings and at weekends, some older people and people with family commitments may be unable or unwilling to attend evening meetings; there would also be travel difficulties – there are more options for daytime travel – and it would take longer, especially for those who live outwith the central belt. Councils and Committees are sometimes challenged to change the times of their meetings to make it easier for people to attend but we, and they, are finding that there are no easy solutions. Nonetheless, Councils and Committees are to be commended for the efforts they have made to vary the days and times of their meetings and to make use of technology such as video-conferencing and Skype.

3. Statistical Information

3.1 The Committee provides some statistical details to the Assembly as a means of highlighting and encouraging the engagement of the Church as a whole with the Nomination Committee process.

3.2 Approximately 3,000 letters inviting nominations were sent out. These went to Ministers, Session Clerks, Presbytery Clerks, the National Office of the Guild, members of the Nomination Committee and Secretaries of Assembly Councils and Committees.

3.3 These letters produced a total of 180 proposed nominations, broken down as follows (some individuals were proposed for more than one committee, and some forms were supported by more than one category *eg* Minister and Kirk Session):

- 39 nominations from 26 Ministers (compared with 40 from 37 last year and 31 from 25 in 2013), with 15 being approached;
- 19 nominations from 10 Kirk Sessions (compared with 22 from 22 last year and 3 from 3 in 2013), with 8 being approached;
- 21 nominations from 9 Presbyteries (compared with 31 from 10 last year and 20 from 14 in 2013), with 5 being approached;
- No nominations from the Guild (compared with 3 last year and 6 in 2013);
- 13 nominations from Nomination Committee members (compared with 10 last year and 2 in 2013), with 11 being approached;
- 97 nominations from Councils and Committees (compared with 78 last year and 112 in 2013), with 81 being approached.

3.4 A total of 117 vacancies required to be filled this year. Around 10 nominations were put forward during the course of the January meeting, these names coming from members of the Nomination Committee and from Councils and Committees in order to fill particular gaps where specific skills and experience were required.

3.5 The Committee will continue to monitor the response rate but would wish to thank all those who have taken the time to consider the matter.

4. Charity Governance

4.1 The General Assembly decided in 2010 to designate the voting members of the Council of Assembly as charity trustees for the Unincorporated Councils and Committees (The Church of Scotland, Scottish Charity Number SC011353). The Nomination Committee was charged by the Assembly with implementing an open recruitment process for new Trustees. The Special Committee on the Review of Charity Governance set out the process to be followed and identified the basic skills required; a skills audit of existing trustees, conducted by the Council itself in 2010, highlighted the skills gaps which the recruitment process would attempt to fill.

4.2 As before, the Nomination Committee arranged for an advertisement to be placed in *Life and Work* and on the Church's website. Interviews for shortlisted candidates were held in December. The Nomination Committee provided the chairman and members of the interview panel and the Convener and Secretary of the Council of Assembly attended as observers. The nomination for a new member of the Council of Assembly brought in this report is that of the successful candidate from that process. The Nomination Committee wishes to thank the applicants for Council of Assembly membership, who so willingly submitted themselves to a rigorous recruitment exercise.

4.3 The Committee also noted that the Conveners of the Ministries Council and of the Panel on Review and Reform were due to retire this year and that their successors would become members of the Council of Assembly and charity trustees for the Unincorporated Councils and Committees. It therefore engaged with the Council and the Panel to ensure that their processes for identifying nominations for a Convener were robust and transparent and that due account was taken of the skills and qualities needed for charity trusteeship as well as for convening a major body. The Committee wishes to draw the Assembly's attention to the nomination as Convener of the Ministries Council of the Rev Neil Glover, minister of Glasgow: Flemington-Hallside and a former Vice-Convener of the Council; and of the nomination of the Rev Graham Duffin, minister of

Loanhead, as Convener of the Panel on Review and Reform. The Committee is pleased to commend Mr Glover and Mr Duffin to the Assembly and to thank both ministers for the readiness with which they have accepted nomination to two of the most arduous and time-consuming roles in the Church, in addition, of course, to continuing in their duties as busy parish ministers.

5. Nominations for Appointment to Councils and Committees

The Committee recommends the following appointments:

Appeals Committee of the Commission of Assembly

Vice-Convener Appointed Helen Jamieson (Carluke: St Andrew's)

Philip Brodie, Carole Hope, *Conveners*
Peter Graham, Helen Jamieson, *Vice-Conveners*

Arbitration Panel

Ministers Retiring Ian Black, Eleanor McMahon

Minister Appointed Jack Holt (Edinburgh: Polwarth)

Members Retiring George Lawson, Fred Stephen

Members Appointed Colin Armstrong (Inverness: Inshes), Sheila Laidlaw (Dunfermline: East), Brian Stewart (Glasgow: Garthamlock and Craigend East)

Assembly Arrangements Committee

Minister Retiring Bryan Kerr

Minister Appointed Bryan Kerr* (Lanark: Greyfriars)

Derek Browning, *Convener*
Judith Pearson, *Vice-Convener*

Audit Committee

Member Retiring Ian Laing

Members Appointed Andrew Croxford (Carnock and Oakley) *subject to the General Assembly increasing the Committee's membership*, Susan Zappert (Birse and Feughside)

Grant Macrae, *Convener*

Chaplains to HM Forces Committee

Ministers Retiring Louis Kinsey, David Young
Minister Appointed Louis Kinsey* (Aberdeen: St Columba's Bridge of Don)
Members Retiring Douglas Hunter, Neil Morrison, James Wardrop
Members Appointed Alexander Bolland (St Andrews: St Leonard's), Colin Hogg (Oxnam), Alistair W Joss (Dundee: St David's High Kirk), Neil Morrison* (Broughton, Glenholm and Kilbucho)

Gordon Craig, *Convener*
 John Murdoch, *Vice-Convener*

Church Art and Architecture Committee

Members Retiring Paul Faris, Alistair Smith, Roger Trueman
Member Resigned Campbell Duff
Members Appointed John Baker (Edinburgh: Corstorphine Craigsbank), Paul Faris* (Innerleithen, Traquair and Walkerburn), David MacDougall (Dundee: Fintry) *subject to the General Assembly increasing the Committee's membership*, Gordon McFarlane (1 yr) (Kinross), Alistair Smith* (Orwell and Portmoak)

Graeme Roberts, *Convener*
 David Logan, *Vice-Convener*

Church and Society Council

Vice-Convener Retiring Christopher Wigglesworth
Vice-Convener Appointed Richard Frazer (Edinburgh: Greyfriars Kirk)
Ministers Resigned Ruth Halley, John Nugent
Ministers Retiring Alexander Fraser, John Laidlaw
Minister Appointed Muriel Pearson (3 yrs) (Glasgow: Cranhill)
Member Resigned John Kennedy
Member Retiring Rona Mackie Black
Members Appointed Graeme Donald (Channelkirk and Lauder), Naomi Dornan (Airdrie: New Monkland), Allan Gordon (3 yrs) (Edinburgh: St Michael's), Rona Mackie Black* (London: St Columba's), John Wilson (Howe of Fife)

Sally Foster-Fulton, *Convener*
 Richard Frazer, *Vice-Convener*

Council of Assembly

Vice-Convener Retiring Iain Johnston
Vice-Convener Appointed Catherine Coull (Dundee: Chalmers Ardler)
Minister Appointed John Ferguson (Aberdeen: Peterculter)

Grant Barclay, *Convener*
 Catherine Coull, *Vice-Convener*

Ecumenical Relations Committee

Minister Retiring Lindsay Schlüter
Minister Appointed Glenn Chestnutt (Gourock: St John's)

Alison McDonald, *Convener*
 Peter Donald, *Vice-Convener*

Iona Community Board

Convener Retiring Allan Gordon
Convener Appointed Alan Kimmitt (Glenrothes: St Columba's)
Member Retiring William Findlay
Members Appointed William Findlay* (Bishopbriggs: Springfield Cambridge), Joanna Love DCS (Glasgow: Colston Milton)

Alan Kimmitt, *Convener*

Judicial Commission

Ministers Retiring Grant Barclay, Derek Brown, Catherine Collins, Alexander Forsyth, Scott McKenna, Jennifer Macrae, Colin Renwick
Ministers Appointed Adam Dillon (Kirkpatrick Juxta I/w Moffat: St Andrew's I/w Wamphray), Thomas Pollock (Glasgow: Sherbrooke St Gilbert's)
Elders Retiring David Alexander, Colin Scott Mackenzie, Leslie Moffat
Elders Appointed Jennifer Dick (Hamilton: Old), Alastair Dunlop (Gorebridge), Andrew Ireland (Glasgow: Hyndland)

Robert Brodie, Morag Mylne, *Conveners*
 David Lunan, Colin Renwick, *Vice-Conveners*

Judicial Proceedings Panel

Ministers Retiring Dorothy Anderson, David Clark, George Cowie, John Ferguson, Thomas Riddell

Ministers Appointed Dorothy Anderson* (Monifieth), David Arnott (Peebles: Old), David Clark* (Presbytery of Dumbarton), George Cowie* (Aberdeen: South Holburn)

Deacons Retiring Morag Crawford DCS, Anne Mulligan DCS

Deacon Appointed Morag Crawford DCS* (Rosyth)

Elders Retiring John Anderson, Elizabeth Ashmole, Alan Dewar, Richard Henderson, Nigel Lawrie, Richard McFarlane, Catherine Mappin, Judith Pearson

Elders Appointed John Anderson* (Edinburgh: Duddingston Kirk), Elizabeth Ashmole* (Stepps), Alan Dewar* (Edinburgh: High (St Giles')), Ian Maclagan (The United Church of Bute)

The following reappointments are subject to the General Assembly approving a change to the membership terms for this Panel:

Minister Appointed Thomas Riddell* (Linlithgow: St Michael's)

Deacon Appointed Anne Mulligan DCS* (Edinburgh: Mayfield Salisbury)

Elders Appointed Richard Henderson* (Edinburgh: Balerno), Nigel Lawrie* (Largs: Clark Memorial), Richard McFarlane* (St Andrews: Holy Trinity), Catherine Mappin* (Wick: St Fergus)

Legal Questions Committee

Convener Retiring Alan Hamilton

Convener Appointed George Cowie (Aberdeen: South Holburn)

Vice-Convener Appointed Alistair May (Rutherglen: Stonelaw)

Minister Retiring Duncan Shaw

Ministers Appointed Alan Reid (Kinross), Alison Swindells (Edinburgh: Greenbank)

Members Retiring Jill Bell, Ian Maclagan

Members Appointed Kevin Cannon (Mearns), Ian Maclagan* (The United Church of Bute)

George Cowie, *Convener*
Alistair May, *Vice-Convener*

Life and Work Advisory Group

Convener Resigned David Denniston

Convener Appointed John Ferguson (Aberdeen: Peterculter)

Member Resigned Lorna Finley

Member Appointed Bill McIntosh (Dunfermline: Abbey)

John Ferguson, *Convener*

Ministries Council

Convener Retiring Neil Dougall

Convener Appointed Neil Glover

Vice-Convener Reappointed Derek Pope* (1 yr)

Ministers Retiring Glenn Chestnutt, Catherine Collins, Keith Graham, Mhorag Macdonald, Scott Raby, Lindsay Schlüter, Graham Smith

Ministers Resigned David Black, Stuart Sharp

Ministers Appointed Graham Astles (Jedburgh: Old and Trinity), Kenneth Borthwick (Edinburgh: Holy Trinity),

Glenn Chestnutt* (Gourock: St John's), Catherine Collins* (Dundee: Broughty Ferry New Kirk), Karen Fenwick (Forfar:

Lowson Memorial), Mhorag Macdonald* (Wishaw: Cambusnethan North), Gary McIntyre (Stirling: St Ninian's

Old), Thomas Macintyre (Lerwick and Bressay), Anthony Stephen (Banchory-Ternan: West)

Member Died Charles Godon

Member Retiring Leslie Moffat

Members Resigned Alan Imrie, Michael Newlands

Members Appointed John Dent (Dundee: Logie St John's (Cross)), Jean McAleer (Closeburn), Gordon McBean

(Dundee: Lochee), Andrew Todd (Burnside Blairbeth)

Neil Glover, *Convener*
Colin Brough, Marjory MacLean, Derek Pope,
Vice-Conveners

Mission and Discipleship Council

Vice-Convener Resigned John Hawthorn

Vice-Convener Appointed Jamie Milliken (Troon: Portland)

Ministers Resigned Sandi McGill, Gillean Maclean

Ministers Retiring Elizabeth Crumlish, Robert Milne

Ministers Appointed Fiona Bullock (2 yrs) (Dun and Hillside), Elizabeth Fisk (Dunfermline: St Ninian's), Robert

Milne* (Broughton I/w Skirling I/w Stobo and Drumelzier I/w Tweedsmuir)

Member Resigned Craig Durning

Members Retiring Helen-May Bayne, Robert McQuistan, Christopher Macrae, Alan Watson

Members Appointed Peter Anderson (Stewarton: John Knox), Cara Chalmers (1 yr) (Orwell and Portmoak), Lynne Eland (East Kilbride: Mossneuk), Moira Land (Oxnam), Iain McLarty (Edinburgh: High (St Giles')), Robert McQuistan* (Kirkmabreck)

Colin Sinclair, *Convener*

Daniel Carmichael, Jamie Milliken, Norman Smith,
Vice-Conveners

Nomination Committee

Ministers Retiring Matthew Bickett, Alan Birss, Colin Caskie, Marion Dodd, John McPake

Ministers Appointed John Collard (Iona I/w Kilfinichen and Kilvickeon and the Ross of Mull), Caroline Lockerbie (Lerwick and Bressay), Carleen Robertson (Eassie, Nevay and Newtyle), Margaret Stein (Haddington: St Mary's), Sean Swindells (Newbattle)

Member Retiring Amanda Philip

Members Appointed Graeme Glover (Edinburgh: Cramond), Lynsey Kimmitt (Dundee: Coldside)

Kenneth Stott, *Convener*

Ann Lyall DCS, *Vice-Convener*

Panel on Review and Reform

Convener Retiring Donald Campbell

Convener Appointed Graham Duffin (Loanhead)

Ministers Retiring Janet Foggie, Caroline Lockerbie

Ministers Appointed Jenny Adams (Duffus, Spynie and Hopeman), Joanne Hood (Hamilton: St John's)

Graham Duffin, *Convener*

David Cameron, *Vice-Convener*

Personnel Appeal Panel

Member Resigned Norma Shippin

Member Appointed Walter Williamson (Bo'ness: St Andrew's)

Presbyterial Commission

Convener Retiring James McNeill

Vice-Conveners Retiring Andrew Gibb, Robert Miller

Vice-Conveners Appointed Graeme Dalglish (Edinburgh: Blackhall St Columba), Shona Haldane (Edinburgh: Leith Wardie)

Ian Miller, *Convener*

Graeme Dalglish, Shona Haldane, *Vice-Conveners*

Safeguarding Appeal Panel

Minister Appointed John Christie (Helensburgh: St Andrew's Kirk)

Members Retiring Eleanore Anderson, Maureen Bowman, Hugh Wright

Member Appointed Jean Fleetwood (Inverness: Old High St Stephen's)

Safeguarding Committee

Minister Retiring Bryce Calder

Minister Appointed Bryce Calder* (Kirkintilloch: St David's Memorial Park)

Karen Campbell, *Convener*

Sheila Ritchie, *Vice-Convener*

Social Care Council

Vice-Convener Retiring Richard Frazer

Vice-Convener Appointed Hugh Stewart (Lochs-in-Bernera I/w Uig)

Minister Retiring Arrick Wilkinson

Ministers Appointed Kenneth Russell (Prison Chaplain), Arrick Wilkinson (Ballantrae)

Member Resigned William Wishart DCS

Members Retiring Stuart Lynch, Alasdair MacRae

Members Appointed Sheelagh Carradice (Musselburgh: Northesk), Kay Keith (Dunscore), Alasdair MacRae* (Deer)

Sally Bonnar, *Convener*

Richard Begg, Hugh Stewart, *Vice-Conveners*

Theological Forum

Minister Retiring Mark Malcolm

Ministers Appointed Johnston McKay (Glasgow: Cathedral (St Mungo's or High)), Ruth Morrison (Clydebank: Abbotsford I/w Dalmuir Barclay)

Members Retiring Liz Grant, Moyra McCallum DCS

Iain Torrance, *Convener*
Frances Henderson, *Vice-Convener*

World Mission Council

Vice-Convener Retiring Christine Sime

Vice-Convener Appointed Susan Brown (Dornoch Cathedral)

Ministers Retiring Russell Barr, Robin Hill, Alan Miller

Ministers Appointed Jan Mathieson (Cawdor I/w Croy and Dalcross), Alan Miller* (Stirling: Church of the Holy Rude I/w Stirling: Viewfield Erskine)

Members Retiring Ailsa Henderson, Maureen Jack

Members Appointed Maureen Jack* (St Andrews: St Leonard's), Margaret Lance (Glasgow: Cathedral (St Mungo's or High)), Peter Murdoch (Stirling: St Columba's), Lorna Tunstall (Inchture and Kinnaird)

Iain Cunningham, *Convener*
Susan Brown, Valerie Brown, *Vice-Conveners*

* denotes second term

In the name of the Committee

KENNETH STOTT, *Convener*
ANN LYALL DCS, *Vice-Convener*
PAULINE WEIBYE, *Secretary*